

Transparency as a Tool in Building Efficient Public Institutions: A Bibliometric Study

Josué de Lima Carvalho¹, Tânia Suely Azevedo Brasileiro²

¹Mestrando do Programa de Pós-graduação em Sociedade, Ambiente e Qualidade de Vida - PPGSAQ, Centro de Formação Interdisciplinar/UFOPA, Santarém/Pa, Brasil.

Email: [josuecarvalho911@gmail.com](mailto:josuocarvalho911@gmail.com)

²Docente na graduação e pós-graduação (PPGSAQ, EDUCANORTE e SND), UFOPA, Santarém/PA, Brasil.

Email : brasileirotonia@gmail.com

Received: 03 Mar 2022,

Received in revised form: 25 Mar 2022,

Accepted: 01 Apr 2022,

Available online: 08 Apr 2022

©2022 The Author(s). Published by AI
Publication. This is an open access article
under the CC BY license

(<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).

**Keywords— Transparency; Public
Governance; Efficient Institutions.**

Abstract— We aim to identify aspects of public transparency in the literature and its influence on the efficiency of public management. For this purpose, a bibliometric study of works published in scientific journals available in the Scopus database was carried out. Initially, 74 academic works were identified using the keywords "transparency", "public governance" and "efficient institutions" after this first filtering, it was restricted only to scientific articles aligned with the theme, generating the final base of 27 articles that were analyzed. quantitatively and qualitatively using the frequency count of the data, finally a word cloud and similarity analysis was carried out with the support of the Iramuteq textual analysis software. Among the main contributions of this article, the understanding of how the works of different origins, years and authors came together in an academic collection that allows us to understand how the authors see public governance and transparency in the construction of efficient institutions.

I. INTRODUCTION

Public management has improved a lot in recent decades, external and internal users (stakeholders) are increasingly informed and participating in the decisions and accountability process in the Public Administration, in all governmental spheres, whether in municipalities, in the federative units or in the union. In view of the assumption, Rodrigues and Cougo (2016) state that the application of public resources in Public Administration is closely linked to the questioning arising from the efficient execution and transparency of Accountability, in the financial disbursement in public works.

Transparency is closely linked to efficiency and effectiveness regarding public finances, given that they

reflect what happens within public management, public finances are mirrors of political and administrative decisions. According to the National Treasury Manual (2012), cost information in the public sector, by materializing the Accountability process, improves transparency, as it allows society as a whole to understand more clearly the use of public resources. Given this context, the New Public Management (NPM) guides changes in public management in order to increase efficiency and effectiveness and spend greater efforts in the decision-making process based on innovations in accounting and Accountability management systems (PARKER AND GOULD, 1999; PÉREZ-LÓPEZ, PRIOR AND ZAFRA-GOMES, 2015). Accountability inserted in public management encourages good practices in the rendering of

accounts to society, seeking efficiency and effectiveness, making managers responsible for their actions as public servants, conditioning them to evidence the accounts referring to the cycle of their management through the portals electronic devices, as provided for in the law on access to information. Heyer (2011) expresses in his work that the tendencies of the new public management (NPM) behave as a strategy for the democratic political reform, in the countries in transition of development. For the author, the philosophy of NPM moves towards a governance approach that emphasizes transparency, performance management and accountability of public sector employees and managers. Peters (2013) attributes that the fundamental meaning of governance is to direct the economy and society towards collective goals. The governance process involves finding ways to identify goals and then identifying ways to achieve those goals.

Based on the above-grounded construction, it is intended to relate the concepts of public governance and transparency with the objective of sustainable development number 16 - SDG 16 (UNITED NATIONS ORGANIZATIONS, 2015) which aims to build efficient institutions in the fight against corruption, transparency, and efficiency in public spending. This research is justified by the need to adapt and expand sustainable practices considered important in all spheres of public organizations, incorporating sustainability into their management models in order to promote changes in organizational culture related to transparency and efficiency. Therefore, the objective of this work is to verify the role of transparency and efficiency in public management and the relationships with the construction of efficient institutions in the perspective of works published in periodicals in the Scopus database. Having as a problem question: What is the perspective on transparency and efficiency related to public management in the construction of efficient institutions in journal publications in the Scopus database?

II. MATERIALS AND METHODS

The research carried out is characterized as bibliometric, as it is a systematic review of the literature, which was carried out from a survey of material already prepared, consisting of scientific articles published in the Scopus database. Severino (2014, p.122) states that "bibliometric research is similar to bibliographic research, and bibliographic research is one that can be carried out based on transcripts available in previous works, from documents that are printed, such as books, articles, theses, among others. And bibliometric research is related to the same characteristics, with the differential of the systematic application of data and the approach that is mainly related

to quantitative data.

Within the bibliometric construction of this work, it was idealized to relate the perspectives between public governance, transparency in accordance with the objective of sustainable development 16 - SDG 16 (UNITED NATIONS ORGANIZATIONS, 2015). After evaluating the theme and carrying out a previous research, three main keywords were identified that were used in the construction of the base of the bibliometric study. These are: Transparency, Public Governance and Efficient Institutions.

According to the aforementioned facts, the database chosen for the research was the Scopus database, using the Capes Periodicals platform with login and password linked to the graduate program. From the first search, 74 articles were identified that corresponded to the keywords used, clarifying that the terms within the keywords that were composed of more than one word were unified in the search through the use of quotation marks. When evaluating these 74 articles, it was noticed that there were several data sources that were not intended to be evaluated, according to the objective outlined for this work, such as books, conference papers, book chapters, among others. Therefore, the limitation was carried out from only articles published in journals, from this cut, the base was limited to 41 articles, after this cut, another cut was made, excluding the year 2021, the justification for this last cut is found in the fact that the year is still in progress, so it is not possible to map the publications carried out with accuracy.

With the result of the last cut, the result of 40 articles was reached, which were extracted from the base, read and analyzed, after reading the abstracts and some total texts of the articles, the number of 27 articles was reached, excluding thirteen for do not fit the research topic. Continuing, the analyzes were initiated according to quantitative data, such as total citations, countries that are most publicized on the subject, main authors and main affiliations of the authors. After analyzing the quantitative data, a qualitative analysis was carried out, relating the approaches adopted by the authors, the main results, contributions, among other characteristics. It is reiterated that the temporal cut was only carried out in the exclusion of the year 2021.

Within the proposal of qualitative analysis, the Content Analysis proposed by Bardin (2016) was used, where the data was characterized according to the objective, analyzing commonalities among the authors, the Iramuteq software was also used as a support tool, which is an analysis software textual. Textual analysis is a specific type of data analysis, in which we deal with transcribed material, that is, texts (NASCIMENTO-SCHULZE AND CAMARGO, 2000). In order to carry out the textual

analysis, the abstract content of the 30 articles was extracted, transforming them into a textual corpus. For Camargo and Justo (2013, p.2), The corpus is constructed by the researcher. It is the text set to be analyzed. In a probable example within a documentary research, if a researcher decides to analyze the 3 articles that appeared in the health section of a newspaper, in a certain period of time, the corpus would be the set of these articles. Therefore, the corpus analyzed in Iramuteq is composed of 27 abstracts, of the 27 articles based on this research.

Therefore, the textual corpus is the junction of the 27 abstracts of the researched articles, which through Iramuteq were analyzed in two different types of analysis, the Word Cloud Analysis and the Similitude Analysis. The following paragraphs describe in greater detail the specificities of the models proposed above. The word cloud method represents for Camargo and Justo (2013) a way of grouping words, organizing them graphically according to their frequency. In the authors' view, it represents a simpler, but graphically interesting, lexical analysis.

Therefore, in order to relate the terms more frequently in the abstracts and the different approaches of the authors, the Word Cloud was the first method of analysis. After this method, an analysis of Similitude was carried out, which will be conceptualized in the next topic of this work.

After the Word Cloud, the abstracts of the articles were analyzed in the "similarity" mode of the Iramuteq textual statistical analysis software that is linked to the R statistical software, the "similarity" analysis allows the researcher to understand how the words of a given textual set relate to groups and divisions of groups. In the words of Melo (2017), the analysis of similitude allows to show in a graph the words that present a link in the textual body, from this analysis it is possible to infer the structure of construction of the text and themes of relative importance.

This type of analysis is based on the graph theory proposed by Marchand and Ratinaud (2012), and is frequently used by researchers of social representations (social cognition). It makes it possible to identify the competitions between the words and its result brings indications of the connectedness between the words, helping to identify the structure of the representation.

III. 3. RESULTS

In the construction of the results of this research, it is firstly worth highlighting the bibliometric data of a quantitative nature that were obtained through the research described in the methodology, a posteriori the qualitative

data will be presented and discussed according to the main results.

The first step of the analysis was to characterize the main data of the research, regarding the authors, title of the works, main results, year of publication and amount of citation, the complete table with the data can be found in complementary documents. In view of the discussions developed by the authors, it is clear that works such as Hoekman (1998) who evaluated how the voluntary rules of the World Trade Organization on government procurement are a useful mechanism to ensure that public procurement procedures are efficient, and Townsend and Eyles (2004) who studied the importance of purchasing inputs to guarantee the supply of potable water. followed a line of reasoning linked to efficiency in public spending and the relationship of these expenditures with transparency, Shirley (1994) assesses the importance of joint work between the public and private spheres in government procurement practices, related the importance of actions that integrate the public and private initiative, Aigul (2013), Alam and Teicher (2012) and Silva (2016) evaluated dictatorial regimes and how their performance may be linked to the lack of transparency and the inability to fight corruption.

Aigul (2013) assesses the scenario in Kazakhstan in the face of a new scenario of building corporate governance with principles linked to sustainable development, access to justice and the responsive role of public institutions, clearly guidelines linked to SDG 16, Silva (2016) assesses the historical restructuring of the democratic regime in Chile, the work is based on Goal 16.5 and Goal 16.6 SDGs, which refer to the reduction of corruption from bribery and the development of responsive and transparent institutions. Alam and Teicher (2012) Analyze the complicated state of governance in Bangladesh and how military dictatorships affected state institutions, developing a symbiotic relationship with the state.

Among the surveyed works, works such as Paul (2007), Dikopoulou and Mihiotis (2012), Mohammed and Ibrahim (2015) and Capezi and Lorenzi (2020) were also identified, which relate the use of information and communication technologies (ICT's) in promotion of public governance through E-government, and how these tools can be used in knowledge management, social control and accountability of financial and budgetary information of public management. The works raise common objectives related to Target 16.10, which seeks to ensure public access to information and the protection of fundamental freedoms, the strengthening of national institutions (Target 16.a) and the guarantee of responsive decision-making (Target 16.7).

Carlos (2006) Discusses the role of parliaments in

at all levels. Next, the data are analyzed in the form of similarity according to the methodology.

Continuing with the analysis, the abstracts of the 27 articles were exposed to similarity analysis, which is based on graph theory (MARCHAND; RATINAUD, 2012). As already defined in the methodology, this type of analysis makes it possible to understand the co-occurrences between the terms, which means that the words are listed in a matrix that produces an algorithm that reveals the relationship between the words through lines, and the thicker the line, the stronger the relationship between the words. The following figure demonstrates the result.



Fig.2 - Similitude Analysis.

Source: by the author/ Iramuteq (2021).

The similarity analysis allowed us to understand the term “public” as a central term obtained from the analysis of the 27 abstracts of the 27 articles, linked directly to the main term, there are 5 key terms, namely: "transparency", "institution", “efficient”, “management” and “budgetary”. The line connecting the key terms to the central term is the thickest of all, with the exception of the term "budgetary" which is linked to the central term by a line of median thickness. the terms linked to the keywords used to carry out the research, therefore, in the authors' view, the public figure (government) needs to be linked to transparency, efficiency and good management (governance). account of the thinnest line that generates this link. Management is linked to governance, finance, benefit, economics, among others such as technology and knowledge, this relationship can be explained by the

authors' main results table, where whenever they addressed governance , related it directly to the benefit, the management of financial resources, the management of knowledge and other adjectives that link the term to good management.

The term efficient, in turn, relates to governmental, increase, democratic, among others, and is also related to the term use, that is, the use of efficiency within the governmental environment. Transparency is related to the terms "key", "effective" and "allow", this relationship allows us to understand how transparency is a key term of effectiveness in public management, and how its permissibility is fundamental for the implementation of effective institutions. . Budget, in turn, is linked to several terms, among them: Control, challenge and parliament, thus demonstrating the subjects of action and how control should be implemented within the budgetary context.

In a final discussion about the research data, it can be seen how the 27 articles used as a basis for this analysis promoted a conversation among themselves, and how it was possible to identify that Governance, Transparency and Efficient Institutions are terms that promote a discussion on the role of public management in building sustainability. Hoekman (1998) deals in his construction with how governments, how public management can promote change in government purchases in promoting sustainability. Silva (2016) builds a dialogue using Chile as a locus on the government's role in fighting corruption, Jacobs and Ploeg (2006) propose a fairer and more transparent way of managing European public higher education institutions. And although it seems that the three articles have different approaches, their purpose is very similar in order to promote transparency, social inclusion, and efficiency in public spending as a tool for building efficient and effective public institutions, which consequently promotes the sustainability in public management. Not only the highlighted authors, but from the union of the abstracts of the articles in the analysis of word cloud and analysis of similitude, that the findings are directly connected with each other, generating a central nucleus around the term public in its relationship with the key terms that allow us to reach the discussions already arranged. Finally, we conclude with the main research findings and contributions.

IV. CONCLUSIONS

Rescuing the objective of identifying in the literature aspects of public transparency and its influence on the efficiency of public management. Through a structured process, 27 works were selected that are related to the theme: transparency as a tool in the construction of efficient public institutions.

From the 27 articles, a bibliometric analysis was carried out, identifying origin, authors, publications per year, among other information. The analysis of the abstracts of the works made it possible to identify similarities and distinctions, it was also possible to understand how the objectives outlined by the authors relate to SDG 16 and its goals.

The articles dealt with topics about equity, public health, social control, technology applied to decision-making, perception of corruption in countries and regimes, among other things. However, the works were mainly discussed when relating Public Management and Governance, Transparency and Effective Institutions.

Therefore, it was possible to understand that in the view of the base of articles used to build efficient, effective institutions that promote inclusion, the conscious expenditure of government resources, and efficiency in decision-making, the figure of transparency through governance is inseparable. The Word Cloud and Similitude analyzes corroborated this result, presenting a central concept based on the term public and key concepts that were directly related to the term, projecting a figure that represented an agreement among all 27 articles, from the most different authors. As for the origin and number of authors surveyed, some similarities were noticed, but mostly their disparities. For future publications, it is suggested to search different databases together with the Scopus base used in this article, so that you can have a broader understanding of the data.

Among the main contributions of this article is the understanding of how the works of different origins, years and authors came together in an academic collection that allows us to understand how the authors see public governance and transparency in the construction of efficient institutions.

REFERENCES

- [1] ABU-RASHED, J.; BERTAUX, N.; OKUNOYE, A. Knowledge management and economic development in developing countries: an examination of the main enablers. **Global Business and Economics Review**, v7, n1, pp. 85-99, 2005.
- [2] AIGUL, M. Control as a method for ensuring quality of public services in the Republic of Kazakhstan | [Kontrolė kaip viešųjų paslaugų kokybės kontrolės metodas Kazachstano Respublikoje]. **Public Policy and Administration**, v. 12, n. 2, pp. 212-225, 2013.
- [3] ALAM, Q.; TEICHER, J. The state of governance in Bangladesh: The capture of state institutions. **South Asia: Journal of South Asia Studies**, v.35, n. 4, pp. 858-884, 2012.
- [4] BALL, R.T.; HAIL, L.; VASVARI, F.P. Equity cross-listings in the U.S. and the price of debt. **Review of Accounting Studies**, 23(2), pp. 385-421, 2018
- [5] BARDIN, L. **Análise de Conteúdo**. São Paulo: Edições 70, 2016.
- [6] CAMARGO, B. V.; JUSTO, A. M. **Tutorial para uso do software de análise textual IRAMUTEQ**. 01. ed. rev. Florianópolis/SC: Laboratório de Psicologia Social da Comunicação e Cognição –LACCOS/UFSC, 2016. 18 p. v. 02. Disponível em: <http://www.iramuteq.org/documentation/fichiers/tutoriel-en-portugais>. Acesso em: 5 ago.2020.
- [7] CAPECE, G.; LORENZI, F. Blockchain and healthcare: Opportunities and prospects for the ehr. **Sustainability (Switzerland)**,12(22),9693, pp. 1-17, 2020.
- [8] CARLOS, S. For better or for worse? The role of parliament in the budgetary process of developing countries | [Pour le meilleur ou pour le pire? le rôle du parlement dans le processus budgétaire des pays en développement Études]. **Revue Française d'Administration Publique**, v.117, n.1, pp. 149-185, 2006.
- [9] CROSS, et al. Government stewardship of the for-profit private health sector in Afghanistan. **Health Policy and Planning**, v. 32, n.3, pp. 338-348, 2017.
- [10] DIKOPOULOU, A.; MIHIOTIS, A. The contribution of records management to good governance. **TQM Journal**, v. 24, n.2, pp. 123-141, 2012.
- [11] HEISENBERG, D. Cutting the bank down to size: Efficient and legitimate decision-making in the European Central Bank after enlargement. **Journal of Common Market Studies**, v41, n°3, pp. 397-420, 2003.
- [12] HEYER, G. NEW PUBLIC MANAGEMENT: A STRATEGY FOR DEMOCRATIC POLICE REFORM IN TRANSITIONING AND DEVELOPING COUNTRIES. **Policing An International Journal of Police Strategies and Management** 34(3):419-433, 2011.
- [13] HOEKMAN, B. Using international institutions to improve public procurement. **World Bank Research Observer**, v 13, n°2, pp. 249-269, 1998.
- [14] JACOBS, B., VAN DER PLOEG, F. Guide to reform of higher education: A European perspective. **Economic Policy**, v.21, n.47, pp. 535-592. 2006.
- [15] KRISTENSEN, F.B. et al. European network for health technology assessment, eunetha: Planning, development, and implementation of a sustainable european network for health technology assessment. **International Journal of Technology Assessment in Health Care**, 25(SUPPL.S2), pp. 107-116, 2009.
- [16] KONONKOVA, N.P.; SHAIMUKHAMETOVA, J.R. LATIN AMERICAN EXPERIENCE OF STATE-PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP. **Iberoamerica** (Russian Federation), (2), pp. 26-48, 2020.
- [17] MARCHAND, P.; P. RATINAUD. **L'analyse de similitude appliquée aux corpus textuels**: les primaires socialistes pour l'élection présidentielle française. Em: Actes des 11eme Journées internationales d'Analyse statistique des Données Textuelles. JADT 2012.(687–699). Presented at the 11eme Journées internationales d'Analyse statistique des Données Textuelles. JADT 2012., Liège, Belgique, 2012.
- [18] MOHAMMED, F.; IBRAHIM, O.B. Drivers of cloud

- computing adoption for E- government services implementation. **International Journal of Distributed Systems and Technologies** v., n.6(1), pp. 1-14
- [19] MELO, C. **IRAMUTEQ-Análise de similitude**. [S. l.]: LEPP-Saúde, 2017. Disponível em: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=F47NgaAbipI>. Acesso em: 29 maio 2021.
- [20] MERGER, E.; PISTORIUS, T. Effectiveness and legitimacy of forest carbon standards in the OTC voluntary carbon Market, **Carbon Balance and Management** v.6, n.4, 2011.
- [21] NASCIMENTO-SCHULZE, C. M.; CAMARGO, B. V. (2000). Psicologia social, representações sociais e métodos. **Temas de psicologia**.Ribeirão Preto, 8 (3), 287-299,2000.
- [22] NORTON, D.A.; ISAAC, R.M. Endogenous production technology in a public goods enterprise. **Research in Experimental Economics** 13, pp. 131-163, 2010.
- [23] ORGANIZAÇÃO DAS NAÇÕES UNIDAS. **Agenda 2030**. objetivo 16. Disponível em:<http://www.agenda2030.com.br/>. Acesso em: 20 mar. 2021.
- [24] PARKER, L.; D.; GOULD, G. **Changing public sector accountability critiquing new directions**, Accountability forum. p.109-135, 1999.
- [25] PAUL, S. A case study of E-governance initiatives in India. **International Information and Library Review**, v. 39, n.4, pp. 176-184, 2007.
- [26] PETERS, B. G. O que é Governança? **Revista do TCU**, nº 127, 2013
- [27] PÉREZ-LOPES, G.; PRIOR, D.; ZAFRA-GÓMEZ, J. L. Rethinking new public management delivery forms and efficiency: long-term effects in Spanish local government. **Journal of public Administration Research and Theory**, 25 (4),1157-1183, 2015.
- [28] RÍOS, P.R.; RIVERA, A.G.; OROPEZA, I.R.; RIVAS BOCANEGRA, R.E. Análisis del
- [29] Proceso de Actualización de Medicamentos en el Cuadro Básico y Catálogo de Insumos del Sector Salud. **Value in Health Regional Issues**, v. 2, n. 3, pp. 387-391, 2013.
- [30] RODRIGUES, D. M.; COUGO, R. L. ACCOUNTABILITY NA ADMINISTRAÇÃO PÚBLICA: ENFOQUE NA GESTÃO FINANCEIRA DAS OBRAS PÚBLICAS NA SECRETARIA MUNICIPAL DA FAZENDA DE BAGÉ.**Revista do CCEI: URCAMP**,[S. l.], v. 20, n. 35, ed. 53, 2016.
- [31] RISSLAND, J. Surveillance of hygiene by local public health authorities - Recommendations (not only) for the public health service in Rhineland-Palatinate | [Infektionshygienische Überwachung durch Gesundheitsämter - Empfehlungen (nicht nur) für den ÖGD in Rheinland-Pfalz]. **Gesundheitswesen**, V. 73, N.11, pp. 737-743, 2011.
- [32] SEVERINO, A. J. **Metodologia do trabalho científico**.São Paulo. Ed. rev. e atual: Cortez,2007.
- [33] SHABAN-NEJAD, et al. A Semantic Framework for Logical Cross-Validation, Evaluation and Impact Analyses of Population Health Interventions. **Studies in Health Technology and Informatics**, 235, pp. 481-485, 2017.
- [34] SHIRLEY, M. M. Privatization in Latin America: Lessons for transitional Europe. **WorldDevelopment**, v.22, 9, pp. 1313-1323, 1994.
- [35] SILVA, P. ‘A Poor but Honest Country’: Corruption and Probity in Chile. **Journal of Developing Societies**, V. 32, N.2, pp. 178-203, 2016.
- [36] SVARD, P. The impact of information culture on information/records management: A case study of a municipality in **Belgium**. **Records Management Journal**, v.24, n.1, pp. 5-21
- [37] TOWNSEND, K.; EYLES, J. Capacity and transparency of potable water regulation in Tijuana, Mexico: Challenges for ensuring water quality at community level. **Health Promotion International**, v19, n1, pp. 77-83, 2004.
- [38] TRUNOV, A.; BEGLYTSIA, V. Synthesis of a trend's integral estimate based on a totality of indicators for a time series data. **Eastern-European Journal of Enterprise Technologies**, 2(4-98), pp. 48-56, 2019.
- [39] VACCA, A. Court of Auditors' performance auditing as a tool to enhance economy, efficiency, effectiveness and transparency in the public administration, an Italian perspective: Strengths and weaknesses. **International Journal of Public Law and Policy**,v. 4, n.2, pp. 103-119, 2014.
- [40] VIVANCO, M.S. Anti-corruption agencies and independence: From augurs to haruspices. A roadmap for Latin America | [Agencias anticorrupción e independencia: ¿augures o arúspices? Una hoja de ruta para Latinoamérica]. **Reforma y Democracia**, v. 56, pp. 59-98,2013.